

The Problems with Home Visiting Programs

Karen R. Effrem, M.D

President – Education Liberty Watch

Karen R. Effrem M.D. 2011

Many Social Ills Associated with Single Parent Families

- 63 percent of all suicides are individuals from single-parent households. (FBI)
- 75 percent of adolescents in chemical-dependency hospitals come from single-parent households. (CDC)
- More than half of all youths incarcerated for criminal acts come from single-parent households. (Children's Defense Fund)

Karen R. Effrem M.D. 2011

Intact Families ERASE the Achievement Gap

“Dr. William Jeynes used “data from the National Educational Longitudinal Survey to examine the impact of student religious commitment and living in intact families on academic achievement among black and Hispanic 12th graders. *Students with intact families and high levels of religiosity scored as well as all white students on most achievement measures and higher than their black and Hispanic counterparts without intact families or high religiosity.* “(J. Urban Ed. Vol 38 No. 1, 2003 - Emphasis added)

Karen R. Effrem M.D. 2011

Home Visiting Does Not Improve Child Development

Program Name	Primary Effects	Secondary Effects
Early Head Start Home Visiting	Favorable: 1 No effect: 21 Unfavorable or ambiguous: 0	Favorable: 3 No effect: 3 Unfavorable or ambiguous: 0
Healthy Families America (HFA)	Favorable: 7 No effect: 27 Unfavorable or ambiguous: 0	Favorable: 0 No effect: 0 Unfavorable or ambiguous: 0
Nurse Family Partnership (NFP)	Favorable: 4 No effect: 35 Unfavorable or ambiguous: 0	Favorable: 2 No effect: 11 Unfavorable or ambiguous: 1

Source: Home Visiting Evidence of Effectiveness

<http://homvee.acf.hhs.gov/document.aspx?rid=2&sid=3>

Karen R. Effrem M.D. 2011

Home Visiting Does Not Improve Child Development

Type of Effects	Primary Effects (% of Effects Measured)	Secondary Effects (% of Effects Measured)
Favorable	13%	25%
No Effect	87%	70%
Unfavorable or Ambiguous	0%	5%

Source: Home Visiting Evidence of Effectiveness
<http://homvee.acf.hhs.gov/document.aspx?rid=2&sid=3>

Karen R. Effrem M.D. 2011

Home Visiting Does Not Improve Child Development

- “It is important to note, however, that the reduction in total behavioral problems on the CBCL [Child Behavior Checklist completed by the mothers] was not corroborated by teachers' reports of child behavior.” (Olds and Kitzman, 2004)
- There were no statistically significant paraprofessional program effects on children's language, executive functioning, emotional regulation, or behavioral adaptation, or on mothers' reports of externalizing behavior problems... There were no statistically significant nurse effects on sensitive-responsive mother-child interaction, children's emotional regulation, or externalizing behavior problems [nurse visited].” (Olds and Robinson, 2004)

Other Problems with Home Visiting

- Medical record review without consent
- Consent may not be voluntary for participation
- Visitors may only have as little as 5 days of training
- Information presented may be unscientific or biased
- Data collection
- Families may unknowingly give up 4th amendment rights

Karen R. Effrem M.D. 2011

Recommendations

- Delete authorizing language for home visiting from statute
- Reallocate federal TANF funds away from home visiting
- Eliminate ECFE home visiting as well

Karen R. Effrem M.D. 2011